



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 2, 2020

1:30 P.M.

This Meeting was Conducted Electronically
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Assistant Planner
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Drury (until 5:50 p.m.), Edmunds, Lenvik, Mahan, and Ooley (at 1:34 p.m.)

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Unzueta; Ellen Kokinda, Administrative Analyst; Timmy Bolton, Associate Planner; Janet Ahern, City TV Production Specialist; Hernandez; Plummer; and Reidel

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individual spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **August 19, 2020**, as amended.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 6/0/1. (Edmunds abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **September 2, 2020**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 7/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Hernandez announced that the revised draft of the Historic Resources Ordinance is posted on the Historic Ordinances website santabarbaraca.gov/HROAmendments. The draft will come back to the Commission on September 16, 2020, and will proceed to Planning Commission and City Council for review.
2. Chair Grumbine thanked Commissioner Drury and Vice Chair Hausz for volunteering as design reviewers for the AIA Charrette.
3. Commissioner Drury announced that he will leave the meeting at 5:50 p.m.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

(1:50PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL1. **524 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-173-039

Zone: M-C

Application Number: PLN2020-00107

Owner: Jason Jaeger & Sep Wolf

Applicant: Jessi Finnicum-Schwartz, Anacapa Architecture

(The Mediterranean style building, remodeled after the earthquake in 1925 by Soule Murphy and Hastings, is a designated Structure of Merit. Proposal to convert the existing commercial building from church and office to a 47-room hotel. The project includes a 401 square foot ground floor addition, 446 square foot second floor addition, and 1,557 square foot third floor addition. The proposal includes a new elevator shaft and stairs at the rear of the building, and removal of a Cork Oak and Palm Tree at the rear of the property. Development Plan Approval findings are required for the construction of new commercial floor area.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires consistency with the Project Compatibility Criteria, Structure of Merit findings, and Development Plan Approval findings for the construction of new commercial floor area. Project requires an environmental finding for a CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 Exemption (Projects Consistent with the General Plan). Project was last reviewed on April 15, 2020.

Actual time: 1:52 p.m.

Present: Jason Jaeger, Owner, Jaeger Partners; Dan Weber, Principal Architect, Anacapa Architecture; Robert Dostalek, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara; and Jessi Finnicum-Schwartz, Applicant, Anacapa Architecture

Public comment opened at 2:14 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Anna Marie Gott
2. Kellam de Forest

Public comment closed at 2:19 p.m.

Motion: Continue two weeks with comments:

1. Study historic photos to see the original design of the tile work underneath the front windows and the light fixtures.
2. Investigate the original paint colors on the windows and doors to find a more historic match and a stronger paint color.
3. Windows and doors need to match their existing condition in terms of recess from the outer wall, profiles, and proportions. The Commission would like to see details of how this will be accomplished.
4. The fire sprinkler riser needs to be resolved on the front corner of the building; show how it is hidden within the wall.
5. Adjust the new divided window and door lights to be in proportion with the existing building lights.
6. The large undivided windows on the south elevation should be more traditional and have division similar to the rest of the doors and windows.
7. Lighting to be more Spanish Colonial Revival; see historic lighting for inspiration.
8. Study historic examples to resolve the cornice.
9. Restudy the profile of the belly band to be more historic.
10. Lift the belly band 30 inches to proportion the third floor windows.
11. Match the wrought iron brackets on the balconies of the south and east elevation to the front.
12. The roof of the elevator shaft is acceptable.
13. The Commission suggests adding a sycamore tree in the space at the front.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, Motion substituted.

The motion was substituted as follows:

Motion: Project Design Approval with the following comments and findings:

1. Study historic photos to see the original design of the tile work underneath the front windows and the light fixtures.
2. Investigate the original paint colors on the windows and doors to find a more historic match and a stronger paint color.
3. Windows and doors need to match their existing condition in terms of recess from the outer wall, profiles, and proportions. The Commission would like to see details of how this will be accomplished.
4. The fire sprinkler riser needs to be resolved on the front corner of the building; show how it is hidden within the wall.

5. Adjust the new divided window and door lights to be in proportion with the existing building lights.
6. The large undivided windows on the south elevation should be more traditional and have division similar to the rest of the doors and windows.
7. Lighting to be more Spanish Colonial Revival; see historic lighting for inspiration.
8. Study historic examples to resolve the cornice.
9. Restudy the profile of the belly band to be more historic.
10. Lift the belly band 30 inches to proportion the third floor windows.
11. Match the wrought iron brackets on the balconies of the south and east elevation to the front.
12. The roof of the elevator shaft is acceptable.
13. The Commission suggests adding a sycamore tree in the space at the front
14. The Commission finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
15. The Commission makes the following Development Plan Approval findings:
 - a. The proposed development complies with all provisions of this Title.
 - b. The proposed development is consistent with the principles of sound community planning.
 - c. The proposed development will not have a significant adverse impact upon the community's aesthetics or character in that the size, bulk, or scale of the development will be compatible with the neighborhood based on the Project Compatibility Analysis criteria found in Sections 22.22.145 or 22.68.045 of this Code.
 - d. The proposed development is consistent with the policies of the City of Santa Barbara Traffic Management Strategy (as approved by City Resolution No. 13-010 dated as of March 12, 2013) as expressed in the allocation allowances specified in SBMC Section 28.85.050. (Ord. 5609, 2013.)
16. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City, because it incorporates the Spanish Colonial character of El Pueblo Viejo in the massing, proportion of openings, use of plaster, and red tiles roofs.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project, as it fits within both State Street and El Pueblo Viejo.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping, in that it has appropriate landscaping for its location on State Street where minimal landscaping is required.

17. As required for Structures of Merit in section 22.22.090 of the Municipal Code: The exterior alterations are being made primarily to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Structure of Merit.

Action: Grumbine/Drury, 6/0/1. (Edmunds abstained.) Motion carried.

Amended

Motion: **Project Design Approval and Final Approval continued two weeks with the following comments and findings:**

1. Study historic photos to see the original design of the tile work underneath the front windows and the light fixtures.
2. Investigate the original paint colors on the windows and doors to find a more historic match and a stronger paint color.
3. Windows and doors need to match their existing condition in terms of recess from the outer wall, profiles, and proportions. The Commission would like to see details of how this will be accomplished.
4. The fire sprinkler riser needs to be resolved on the front corner of the building; show how it is hidden within the wall.
5. Adjust the new divided window and door lights to be in proportion with the existing building lights.
6. The large undivided windows on the south elevation should be more traditional and have division similar to the rest of the doors and windows.
7. Lighting to be more Spanish Colonial Revival; see historic lighting for inspiration.
8. Study historic examples to resolve the cornice.
9. Restudy the profile of the belly band to be more historic.
10. Lift the belly band 30 inches to proportion the third floor windows.
11. Match the wrought iron brackets on the balconies of the south and east elevation to the front.
12. The roof of the elevator shaft is acceptable.
13. The Commission suggests adding a sycamore tree in the space at the front.
14. The Commission finds that the project qualifies for an exemption from further environmental review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, based on the City staff analysis and CEQA Certificate of Determination on file for this project.
15. The Commission makes the following Development Plan Approval findings:
 - a. The proposed development complies with all provisions of this Title.
 - b. The proposed development is consistent with the principles of sound community planning.
 - c. The proposed development will not have a significant adverse impact upon the community's aesthetics or character in that the size, bulk, or scale of the development will be compatible with the neighborhood based on the Project Compatibility Analysis criteria found in Sections 22.22.145 or 22.68.045 of this Code.
 - d. The proposed development is consistent with the policies of the City of Santa Barbara Traffic Management Strategy (as approved by City Resolution No. 13-010 dated as of March 12, 2013) as expressed in the allocation allowances specified in SBMC Section 28.85.050. (Ord. 5609, 2013.)
16. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City, because it incorporates the Spanish Colonial

character of El Pueblo Viejo in the massing, proportion of openings, use of plaster, and red tiles roofs.

- b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project, as it fits within both State Street and El Pueblo Viejo.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping, in that it has appropriate landscaping for its location on State Street where minimal landscaping is required.
17. As required for Structures of Merit in section 22.22.090 of the Municipal Code: The exterior alterations are being made primarily to substantially aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Structure of Merit.

Action: Grumbine/Drury, 6/0/1. (Edmunds abstained.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:40 TO 3:48 P.M. ***

(2:50PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

2. DOWNTOWN AND WATERFRONT CITY RIGHT-OF-WAY

Assessor's Parcel Number:	Multiple Locations in City Right-of-Way
Zone:	C-G, M-C, HRC-2, S-D-3, P-R, H-C
Application Number:	PLN2020-00378
Owner:	City of Santa Barbara
Applicant:	Samuel Furtner, Public Works
Business Name:	Morgan Ramaker, BCycle

(In partnership with the City permitted bike share operator, BCycle, the Public Works Department is proposing the first phase of the Pilot Bike Share Program. When complete, the project will involve the installation of 500 bike share docks, which will serve 250 electric-assist bikes in a public bike share system. Of the 500 docks, around 300-350 will be located downtown or along State Street. The remaining 150-200 docks will be located along the Waterfront. A number of enrollment kiosks will be installed to help serve walk-up customers. These docks and bike share "stations" (grouping of docks) will be located in the furniture zone, adjacent to other street fixtures including: light poles, newspaper stands, planters and street trees, and existing bike hitching posts. Along State Street and in the Downtown area, these stations will consist of small groups of 2-6 docks. Along the Waterfront, and in higher usage area, this dock number may increase to accommodate additional users.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project requires consistency with the Project Compatibility Criteria. Project was last reviewed on August 5, 2020.

Actual time: 3:48 p.m.

Present: Samuel Furtner, Associate Transportation Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Rob Dayton, Transportation Planning & Parking Manager, City of Santa Barbara; and Morgan Ramaker, Executive Director, BCycle

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) granted Project Design Approval and Final Approval for the areas within ABR jurisdiction. Coastal review is applied to the project, so if the HLC grants approval, it will be contingent upon the granting of a Coastal Exemption.

Public comment opened at 4:06 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Kellam de Forest
2. Anna Marie Gott
3. James Marston

Written correspondence from Pamela Boehr, Allied Neighborhoods Association, Christine Neuhauser, and Craig Boehr was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:14 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval of the black color and the kiosk without the scroll.

Action: Edmunds/, Motion failed due to lack of second.

Motion: Continue indefinitely with the comment that the Commission believes the aesthetics are not appropriate to the downtown core of State Street.

Action: Hausz/Drury, 5/2/0. (Edmunds and Ooley opposed.) Motion carried.

(3:35PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

3. CITY RIGHT-OF-WAY BETWEEN YANONALI AND GUTIERREZ STREETS

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-976, ROW-003-346, ROW-002-026

Zone: Zones Adjacent To City Right-Of-Way: M-C, HRC/S-D-3

Application Number: PLN2020-00024

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Eric Goodall, Public Works

(Proposal for improvements at the State Street Undercrossing beneath Highway 101, located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The City of Santa Barbara has an active project to widen the sidewalks through the State Street Undercrossing of Highway 101. The sidewalk widening will occur between the north side of the Yanonali Street intersection to the south side of the Gutierrez Street intersection, to improve the pedestrian walking experience between the Downtown and the Waterfront neighborhoods. The project will include safety improvements for cyclists by widening the bike lanes at the undercrossing and providing buffers between vehicular traffic and cyclists. The number of vehicle lanes at the undercrossing beneath Highway 101 will be reduced to one through lane in each direction, with a center buffer for emergency access. The project includes aesthetic and lighting enhancements, as well as the removal and in-kind replacement of four non-specimen palm trees, two jacarandas, and 14 gold medallion trees.)

Project Design Approval is required. Project requires consistency with the Project Compatibility Criteria. Project was last reviewed on February 19, 2020.

Actual time: 5:02 p.m.

Present: Jessica Grant, Supervising Transportation Planner, City of Santa Barbara; Philip Suding, Suding Design Landscape Architects; Jeff Shelton, Architect; and Ann Kale, Lighting Expert, Ann Kale Associates Inc.

Public comment opened at 5:29 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval with the following comments and findings:

1. The Commission finds the design exceptional and appreciates the artistic development.
2. The purple/black color needs to be reviewed and should be blacker in color than blue or red.
3. Study the lighting at 3000k instead of 2700k.
4. Study alternatives to the domed refractor.
5. Provide lighting specifications and study so the Commission can see proper illumination, especially under the underpass.
6. Regularize the geometry of the wrought iron guard rail and swag.
7. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 5/1/0. (Ooley opposed. Drury absent.) Motion carried.

Commissioner Ooley opposed because he believes that the project is not consistent with the standards.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:04 P.M. ***